

Mr. Tim Lucey
Cork City Manager

20th March 2012

Dear Mr. Tim Lucey

Thank you for your reply to my correspondence and report on the human toxicity, environmental impact and legal implications of water fluoridation. I am copying relevant Government Departments with this correspondence, in accordance with regulatory requirements, so that they may be aware of the contents of this correspondence.

I acknowledge that as Chief Executive of Cork City Council you have informed me that the City Council will continue to fluoridate its drinking water supplies pending direction otherwise from the Government.

I am concerned especially given the medical statistics and findings with respect to Cork City and County, as examined in my report, that as Chief Executive of Cork City Council, you would not address the main item of my previous correspondence regarding legal due diligence and minimum standard of care required to ensure public safety.

Whilst we agree that government legislation requires local authorities to add water fluoridation chemicals to drinking water, the local authority as the 'operator' must, however, ensure that this is undertaken in compliance with minimum legal health and safety requirements and in accordance with EU law.

Every local authority or business is required by law to have the necessary scientific information and documentation to demonstrate that any chemicals used by their employees (not to mention that are added to public drinking water) have been tested in accordance with international standards and are safe for public consumption.

As it is the Department of Health who mandate this legislation, they or some other body must provide this information to the Department of Environment, Heritage and Local Government from which the information must be provided to the relevant local authorities responsible for provision of water services. All one is asking of your office is for legal due diligence in accordance with relevant chemicals' statutory provisions including EU and National Regulations that mandate the maintenance of such registers and the keeping of such records.

The Oireachtas issue many acts of legislation that must be enforced by local authorities. It is the responsibility of local authorities, however, to ensure that relevant EU and national law as well as health and safety legislation is complied with by ensuring compliance with Government policy. In such **purposes** as Chief Executive of Cork City Council, you will be aware that in

accordance with EU law, it is inappropriate to use chemicals such as hexafluorosilicates compounds that are currently being used for fluoridating drinking water that may be labelled as 'non-toxic', 'non-harmful' 'non polluting' unless there is documentary evidence to support any such claims. (SENSE)

In this matter, you should be aware that the European Commission's Scientific Committee on Health and Environmental Risks (SCHER) and the European Commission Directorate General for Health and Consumers have clearly found that no human health risks assessments have been undertaken on these chemical substances.

Certain health risks, however, have clearly been identified by both the EU Commission and United States' National Research Council (NRC) scientific committees including that infants who are fed formula milk constituted with fluoridated water and individuals with diabetics are the most at risk of negative health impacts from exposure to fluoridated water. In addition, both the SCHER and NRC reports identified additional epidemiology, toxicology, clinical medicine, and environmental exposure assessments that need to be undertaken in order to fill data gaps in the hazard profile, the health effects and the exposure assessment of fluoride. Chapter 16 of my report provided to your offices lists a minimum of fifty-nine recommended studies required to be undertaken on fluoridation compounds as recommended by international scientific bodies to quantify the public health risks from fluoridation of drinking water supplies.

Further research was also recommended in assessing the health and environmental risks that may be associated with the use of the most common drinking water fluoridation agents like silicofluorides, taking into account their hazard profiles, their mode of use in water fluoridation, their physical chemical behaviour when diluted in water and the possible adverse effects they may have in exacerbating fluoride health effects as reported in some scientific studies. As I have previously outlined in my report and in accordance with legislation^{1,2,3,4} In accordance with statutory legislation the Health Service Executive is required to establish testing protocols to ensure that adequate epidemiology, toxicology, clinical medicine and environmental exposure assessments are undertaken to protect the consumer as well as determine the environmental impact from exposure to silicofluorides, This must be undertaken in conjunction with other Departments and State agencies including the Department of Environment, Department of Agriculture and Food and Fisheries, the Food Safety Authority and the EPA.

Finally, as I communicated to you in my letter of the 8th March last, as Chief Executive you have a legal responsibility to ensure legal due diligence for

¹ Directive 2006/121/EC

² Regulation (EC) No 1907/2006 Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Of 18 December 2006

³ Regulation (EC) No 1272/2008 Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Of 16 December 2008

⁴ The Chemicals Act 2008

Cork City Council to protect not just your offices but the public whom you serve. Therefore, I request once again, in the absence of appropriate human health risk information and environmental assessments, as required by EU law, that you seek a moratorium on water fluoridation until such information is readily available and provided to your offices.

Ultimately I would hope that the Department of Health would accept the findings of the SCHER report, which found that the continued systemic exposure of the population to fluoride in drinking water is highly questionable and not without public health risk and that they would end the policy of water fluoridation forthwith.

This would be the logical decision and would save the exchequer much needed finance that could be spent on more appropriate programmes elsewhere.

CC: Minister for Agriculture, Fisheries and Food
Minister for the Environment, Heritage and Local Government
Minister for Health and Children
Minister for Justice, Equality and Law Reform
Irish National Accreditation Board
Environmental Protection Agency